An Examination of the Effectiveness of the Chairman and Chief Executive Officer in Mergers and Acquisitions in Australia

By
Nigel S. Garrow
BA (Hons), MBA

A thesis submitted in fulfilment of the requirements for the degree of Doctor of Philosophy (PhD)

Macquarie Graduate School of Management
Macquarie University
Sydney, Australia
April 2012
Abstract

Mergers and acquisitions (M&A) continue to be value destroying for many acquiring firm shareholders, but value enhancing for the acquired firms’ shareholders. Lack of continuity of tenure, agency problems and animal spirits in the acquiring and acquired firms may contribute to this loss of value. Best corporate governance practice proposes that the roles of Chairman and Chief Executive should be performed by different people and yet there is a limited amount of analysis linking these separate roles with firm performance. This study examines acquisitions in Australia between 1990 and 2006 and finds that the period of joint tenure, when the Chairman and CEO in the acquiring firm have been in their respective roles together, is a statistically significant contributor to acquiring firm shareholder value in M&A activity. A significantly negative correlation exists between CEO remuneration change and M&A outcomes indicating agency problems, whilst animal spirits are also in evidence around the time of an acquisition. A contribution to the debate about hubris in M&A suggests that narcissism may be more prevalent than hubris. Improvements in transparency for the remuneration and nominations committees are recommended to address some of the issues of corporate governance raised in this study.
Acknowledgments

I am deeply indebted to many people for providing me with direction, support and enthusiasm during my research. In particular I would like to thank my two much respected supervisors, Associate Professor Guy Ford and Professor Tom Valentine on whose time I trespassed and I am sure, on occasion, whose patience I tried.

Associate Professor Guy Ford provided the academic direction that my research should take whilst encouraging and willingly offering invaluable suggestions when I veered off at a tangent, which unfortunately in my enthusiasm I often did, and bringing me back on course. His knowledge and leadership have been immeasurable.

Professor Tom Valentine provided rigour to my research and a sense of drive and purpose to bring it to fruition with regular guidance and input. Tom is not only a mentor but a valued colleague and friend.

Dr Steven Segal requires a special mention since if it were not for him this thesis would never have started, for it was Steven who suggested that I undertake a PhD. This simple suggestion and his encouragement laid before me the joys of research, for which I am grateful.

I would also like to thank Phanh Oudomlith of Macquarie University library, who was constantly inundated with my requests for information, books and access to online databases. Without his help this thesis would have taken much longer to complete.

My sons, Ben, Edward and Matthew, also need a mention for their understanding when I
contemplated this new venture and new career. They have supported my decisions and I am truly blessed to have such lovely sons. I would like to give a special mention to Edward, who gave his time enthusiastically and patiently to help me transform my very basic charts and tables into the format featured within this research.

This entire venture would never have been possible without the wholehearted, affectionate support and sacrifices of my partner, Christine Bell; I will be eternally grateful to Chris for enabling me to undertake and complete this PhD.
Declaration

I, Nigel Stephen Garrow, declare and certify that this thesis, presented to the Macquarie Graduate School of Management (MGSM), Macquarie University, is in fulfilment of the requirements for the Degree of Doctor of Philosophy in Management. The work presented in this thesis is, to the best of my knowledge and belief, original, except as acknowledged in the text. The material has not been submitted, either in whole or in part, for a degree at this or any other university. The document does also not contain material previously published to which due reference has not been made in the text.

Nigel Stephen Garrow

April 2012
# Table of Contents

Abstract .................................................................................................................................. iii  
Acknowledgments ................................................................................................................... v  
Declaration ............................................................................................................................ vii  
Table of Contents ................................................................................................................... ix  
List of Tables ......................................................................................................................... xiii  
List of Figures ........................................................................................................................ xv  
List of Appendices ................................................................................................................ xvi  

## Chapter 1: Introduction: Research Hypotheses and the Context of the Study  
1.1. Introduction .................................................................................................................... 1  
1.2. The Hypotheses ............................................................................................................ 4  
1.3. Methodology ................................................................................................................. 7  
1.4. Behavioural Context ..................................................................................................... 8  
1.5. Corporate Governance ................................................................................................. 9  
1.6. Thesis Tenet ................................................................................................................. 11  
1.7. Thesis Outline ............................................................................................................... 11  

## Chapter 2: Literature Review ......................................................................................... 12  
2.1. Introduction .................................................................................................................... 12  
2.2. Review of International M&A Literature ..................................................................... 13  
  2.2.1. Accounting or Market-Based Data ........................................................................ 13  
  2.2.2. Agency, Stewardship, or Hubris ........................................................................... 14  
  2.2.3. Market-based Performance Analyses .................................................................... 16  
  2.2.4. Other Studies ....................................................................................................... 19  
2.3. Australian Studies ........................................................................................................ 21  
  2.3.1. Acquirer and Acquiree Performance .................................................................... 22  
  2.3.2. Corporate Governance ....................................................................................... 34
In a US study of 937 mergers and 227 tender offers covering the period 1955 to 1987, Agrawal et al. (1992) estimated the cumulative average abnormal return (CAAR) to acquirer shareholders during each 12-month period following the acquisition; the results are presented in Table 2–1. Abnormal Returns to Acquirer Shareholders

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Table 5–1. Sectors</th>
<th>......................................................................................................................... 76</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Table 5–2. Study Sample</td>
<td>....................................................................................................................... 79</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Table 6–1. Analysis of CARB Acquirer Profiles</td>
<td>...................................................................................................................... 94</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Table 6–2. Analysis of CARA Acquirer Profiles</td>
<td>...................................................................................................................... 97</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Table 6–3. CARA Regression Equations</td>
<td>....................................................................................................................... 101</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Table 6–4. CARB Regression Equations</td>
<td>....................................................................................................................... 103</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Table 6–5. CARB Regression Equations for CEO Tenure Analysis</td>
<td>....................................................... 107</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Table 6–6. CARB Analyzed by Year Following Acquisition</td>
<td>....................................................... 109</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Table 6–7. CARB Results</td>
<td>....................................................................................................................... 111</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Table 6–8. Results for CARB1</td>
<td>....................................................................................................................... 113</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Table 6–9. CARB1 with Joint Tenure and CEO Tenure</td>
<td>....................................................... 114</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Table 6–10. Results for CARB2</td>
<td>....................................................................................................................... 115</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Table 6–11. Results for CARB3</td>
<td>....................................................................................................................... 117</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Table 6–12. CARB Positive and Negative Acquirers</td>
<td>....................................................................................................................... 118</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Table 6–13. CARB1, CARB2, CARB3 Correlations</td>
<td>....................................................................................................................... 119</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Table 6–14. Results for CARD and Joint Tenure</td>
<td>....................................................................................................................... 123</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Table 6–15. Results for TGTCAR</td>
<td>....................................................................................................................... 125</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Table 7–1. Correlation Analysis, Selected Dependent and Independent Variables</td>
<td>....................................................... 133</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Table 7–2. Comparison of Joint Tenure and Cumulative Abnormal Returns</td>
<td>....................................................... 136</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Table 7–3. Comparison of CEO Tenure and Cumulative Abnormal Returns</td>
<td>....................................................... 136</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Table 7–4. Average CAR: CARD, CARC, CARB</td>
<td>....................................................................................................................... 137</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Table 7–5. CARA, CARB and REMCHG</td>
<td>....................................................................................................................... 143</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>
Table 7–6. Remuneration Change Correlation Analysis ................................................................. 143
Table 7–7. Correlation of Dividend Payout and Related Variables ............................................. 146
Table 7–8. Dividend per Share and EPS Comparisons ............................................................... 150
Table 7–9. Analysis of Consideration Paid as Proportion of Acquirer Net Assets ..................... 152
Table 7–10. Analysis of Consideration Paid as Proportion of Acquirer Net Assets (excluding two outliers) ..................................................................................................................... 153
Table 7–11. Analysis of Positive and Negative CARB Acquirers ................................................ 155
Table 7–12. Analysis of Media and Consideration ..................................................................... 156
Table 7–13. Analysis of Target CAR ......................................................................................... 157
Table 7–14. Correlation of Board Structure and Consideration .................................................. 162
Table 7–15. Analysis of CAR B, with Joint Tenure.................................................................... 163
Table 7–16. Analysis of Target CAR ......................................................................................... 164
Table 7–17. Analysis of CONSIDPERACQ2 .............................................................................. 164
Table 7–18. SUR Estimates: CARB .......................................................................................... 165
Table 7–19. SUR Estimates: TGTCAR ..................................................................................... 166
Table 7–20. SUR Estimates: CONSIDPERACQ2 ..................................................................... 167
Table 7–21. Correlation Matrix for Errors .................................................................................. 168
Table 7–22. Linear Regression Equation for Different Periods of Joint Tenure ............................ 169
Table 7–23. Linear B Regression Equation ................................................................................ 172
Table 7–24. Linear B Regression Equation, Excluding Non-significant Variables .................... 173
Table 7–25. Probit, Logit and Gompit Equations ...................................................................... 178
List of Figures

Figure 6–1. Probability Plot of CARA.....................................................................................................98
Figure 6–2. Probability Plot of CARB...................................................................................................111
Figure 6–3. Probability Plot of CARB1 .................................................................................................115
Figure 6–4. Probability Plot of CARB2 .................................................................................................116
Figure 6–5. Probability Plot of CARB3 .................................................................................................118
Figure 6–6. Graphical Analysis of CARB2 and CARB3 Based on CARB1 Outcome ......................120
Figure 6–7. Graphical Analysis of CARB1 and CARB3 Based on CARB2 Outcome ......................121
Figure 6–8. Graphical Analysis of CARB1 and CARB2 Based on CARB3 Outcome ......................122
Figure 6–9. Probability Plot of CARD ...................................................................................................124
Figure 6–10. Probability Plot of TGTCAR...........................................................................................125
Figure 7–1. Graphical Representation of Joint Tenure, CARB, Dividend Payout, Remuneration Change ........................................................................................................................................131
Figure 7–2. Microsoft Excel Line of Best Fit for Remuneration Change, Joint Tenure, Dividend Payout ........................................................................................................................................132
List of Appendices

Appendix I. Research Theories ............................................................................................................ 216
Appendix II. Correlations of Dependent and Independent Variables ................................................. 221
Appendix III. Data Set by Acquisition .................................................................................................. 238
Appendix IV. Acquisitions ranked in order of CARB1 ........................................................................ 242
Appendix V. Cumulative Abnormal Return Raw Data .......................................................................... 244
Appendix VII. The nature and effect of a firm’s Chairman and CEO on firm performance ............... 303
Appendix VIII. Article accepted for publication in The Journal of Applied Research in Accounting and
Finance, 2012 ....................................................................................................................................... 304