Trust and Betrayal: A Conceptual Analysis

Brennan Michael Jacoby

BA (Philosophy) Spring Arbor University, United States

MA (Philosophy) Western Michigan University, United States

This thesis is presented for the degree of Doctor of Philosophy submitted in the Faculty of Arts, Macquarie University.

October 2011
# Contents

Abstract ............................................................................................................................... I  
Statement of Candidate ..................................................................................................... II  
Acknowledgments ............................................................................................................... III  
Introduction ......................................................................................................................... 1  

Chapter 1: Trust as a Cluster Concept ............................................................................. 7  
Section 1: Introduction ....................................................................................................... 7  
Section 2: Four Examples of Trust ..................................................................................... 9  
The Co-Parent Relationship ............................................................................................... 10  
The “Trust Fall” Exercise ................................................................................................. 11  
The Peruvian Artist ............................................................................................................ 12  
The Christmas Truce ........................................................................................................ 12  
Section 3: Features, Types, and Characteristics of Trust Evident in the Phenomena .... 15  
Section 4: Influential Approaches to the Concept of Trust and Their Limitations ....... 22  
Section 4.1: Risk-Assessment Approaches to Trust ......................................................... 23  
Section 4.2: Will-Based Approaches to Trust .................................................................... 29  
Section 4.3: Participant Stance Approaches to Trust ....................................................... 40  
Section 4.4: Trust-Responsiveness Approaches to Trust ................................................ 47  
Section 5: Trust as a Cluster Concept ............................................................................. 53  

Chapter 2: Trustworthiness, Trustability, and Mere Reliability ............................... 61  
Section 1: Introduction ..................................................................................................... 61  
Section 2: From Competence and Commitment to Character ....................................... 65  
Section 2.1: Trustworthiness as Competence ................................................................. 65  
Section 2.2: Trustworthiness as Competence and Commitment ................................... 68
Section 2.3: Trustworthiness as a Kind of Virtuous Character ................................................. 78
Section 3: Supplementing Trustworthiness with Trustability .................................................. 93

Chapter 3: Institutional Trust and Trustworthiness ................................................................. 101
Section 1: Introduction ............................................................................................................. 101
Section 2: Extending the Concept of Trust to Institutional Contexts ................................. 105
Section 2.1: Challenges to Applying the Concept of Trust to Institutional Contexts .......... 105
Section 2.2: A Substantive Account of Trust in Institutional Contexts ............................... 109
Section 3: Trustability in Institutional Contexts .................................................................... 117
Section 4: Trustworthiness in Institutional Contexts ............................................................ 130
Section 4.1: An Account of Institutional Character ............................................................... 131
Section 4.2: Virtuous Professional Roles .............................................................................. 135
Section 4.3: Integrated Virtuous Character in Institutional Contexts .................................. 138

Chapter 4: Betrayal .................................................................................................................. 147
Section 1: Introduction ........................................................................................................... 147
Section 2: Betrayal Phenomena ............................................................................................. 149
Judas: Betrayed Friendship ...................................................................................................... 149
Tiger Woods: Betrayal in Marriage .......................................................................................... 150
The Cambridge Spies: Betrayal in Citizen-Nation Relations ................................................. 152
Section 3: A Preliminary Analysis of Betrayal .................................................................... 153
Section 3.1: Harm .................................................................................................................. 154
Section 3.2: Deliberate Use of a Relationship to Further One’s Own Interests ................. 156
Section 3.3: Disappointment of Expectations ...................................................................... 161
Section 4: Understanding Betrayal as a Type of Disloyalty ............................................... 166
Section 5: The Morality of Betrayal ..................................................................................... 175
Section 6: Testing and Explaining Trust’s Vulnerability to Betrayal .................................. 179
Abstract

Vulnerability to betrayal has been identified as a distinguishing feature of trust, but there has been little direct analysis of betrayal or its implications for understanding trust. A clear account of betrayal is needed for at least two reasons: to explain the distinction between trust and mere reliance; and to explicate the challenges facing trusters who have been betrayed. If it is true that when we trust we risk betrayal, then every instance of trust involves accepting that others might betray us. The risk of betrayal may fade into the background of most trusters’ interactions with others, but it will feature significantly in the cognitive and affective experiences of those who have been betrayed. Betrayal can result in distrust, loss of confidence in knowing who can be trusted, and responses such as resentment and hostile emotions. These effects can inhibit trust after betrayal, but they are not always bad. Distrust, loss of confidence, resentment and hostility may prevent a victim from trusting unwisely or too quickly. That said, these effects of betrayal can also inhibit reasonable placement of trust. And yet some victims do trust after being betrayed. In this thesis I analyse trust and trustworthiness and use distinctions developed in that analysis to explain betrayal, its impact on trust, and the conceptual issues raised by trust after betrayal.
Statement of Candidate

I certify that the work in this thesis entitled “Trust and Betrayal: A Conceptual Analysis” has not previously been submitted for a degree nor has it been submitted as part of requirements for a degree to any other university or institution other than Macquarie University. I also certify that the thesis is an original piece of research and it has been written by me. Any help and assistance that I have received in my research work and the preparation of the thesis itself have been appropriately acknowledged. In addition, I certify that all information sources and literature used are indicated in the thesis.

Brennan Michael Jacoby (Student ID: 41268067)
October 2011
Acknowledgments

I would like to express my gratitude to my principle supervisor, Cynthia Townley, for her patience, excellent supervision, and generosity. Working with her over the past few years has greatly enhanced my skills as a philosopher and writer. I am also grateful to my associate supervisor, Professor Catriona Mackenzie, for her patience, support, and input. Both of my advisors have been dedicated to the success of this project throughout the duration of my candidature. I am thankful for the sacrifices they made in offering me their time, expertise and guidance.

I am also very thankful for colleagues and friends who engaged me in stimulating conversations about trust and betrayal, listened to me externally process my arguments, or assisted me in editing final drafts. In particular I would like to acknowledge: Luke Armfield, Lise Marie Andersen, Kenton Gribble, Bryden Neville, Jacqui Poltera, Mary Walker, and Neralie Wise.

I would not have been able to complete this thesis without the love, support and encouragement of my wife, Karina Jacoby. I am deeply thankful for the encouragement she gave me and for the perspective she brought to my work.

During my candidature, my thinking about trust and betrayal was influenced by my Christian world-view. The God that I worship is relational. Trust and betrayal are not foreign concepts to him. I wish to express my appreciation to God for faithfully guiding me in this challenging work, and consistently sustaining me.

For funding, I thank the Macquarie University Research Excellence program and the Macquarie Department of Philosophy. It has been an honour and a privilege to be associated with both of them.